BEFORE THE COUNTY COURT OF DESOTO COUNTY, MISSISSIPPI

STATE OF MISSISSIPPI, CITY OF HERNANDO , PLAINTIFF

VS. CAUSE NO.: S2020-0005

GEORGE WALKER WELCH,

DEFENDANT

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS HAD AND DONE IN THE BENCH TRIAL OF THE ABOVE STYLED AND NUMBERED CAUSE, BEFORE THE HONORABLE ALLEN B. COUCH, JR., COUNTY COURT JUDGE, AT APPROXIMATELY 1:15 P.M. ON THE 28TH DAY OF SEPTEMBER, 2020.

APPEARANCES:

REPRESENTING THE PLAINTIFF:

HONORABLE ELIZABETH PAIGE WILLIAMS, ESQ. Williams & Williams 217 West Center Street Hernando, Mississippi 38632 662-449-4305

REPRESENTING THE DEFENDANT:

HONORABLE JOHN KEITH PERRY, JR., ESQ. Perry Griffin, PC 5699 Getwell Road, Building G5 Southaven, Mississippi 38672 662-536-6868

MICHELLE A. BROWN, CCR #1395 DeSoto County Official Court Reporter 2535 Highway 51 South, Hernando, MS 38632 michellebrown.csr@gmail.com

1 Eight years with the City of Hernando or in law 2 enforcement in all? 3 Α City of Hernando. Was that your first and only law enforcement 4 0 job? 5 6 Yes. Α 7 Are you working in law enforcement right now? Q 8 No. Α 9 All right. And in those years, you don't remember making an arrest based off of a parking 10 11 violation? 12 No, I don't. Α 13 Mr. Welch's vehicle was parked in front of the 14 house, right? 15 Α Yes. 16 Other than being parked in front of the house, 17 you didn't see him driving it, did you? 18 Α No. You didn't see him doing anything other than 19 20 being in his home on a Sunday morning, right? 21 Α Correct. 22 You said he came to the door and met you at the 23 front door, right? 24 Α Yes. And when he met you at the front door, he didn't 25 26 threaten you and tell you to get off of his grass or anything like that, did, he, or get out of his yard? 27 28 Α No.

In fact, he engaged and talked to you, right?

29

Q

- 1 A Yes.
- 2 Q And he did -- according to your record, he said
- 3 that his neighbors are fucking bitches for calling the
- 4 police on him. Is that arrestable?
- 5 A No.
- 6 Q He wasn't being loud, was he?
- 7 A Yes.
- 8 Q When you testified before, do you remember
- 9 saying that he cussed? It didn't sound like he got loud
- 10 with you, did it?
- 11 A Repeat your question.
- 12 Q When you testified previously, you didn't say he
- 13 got loud. You said he seemed agitated before. Now you're
- 14 saying that he was loud, correct?
- 15 A I don't recall if you asked that question
- 16 previously.
- 17 Q Oh, I asked it. And I'm asking you now, though,
- 18 based off your memory and your recollection, was he load?
- 19 A Yes, he was.
- 21 A I don't recall if there were neighbors outside.
- Q Was he inciting people or anything like that
- 23 that you saw?
- 24 A Inciting?
- 25 Q Inciting.
- 26 A I don't recall.
- 27 Q He was in his own house Sunday morning, right?
- 28 A Yes.
- 29 Q And you said yourself that you could go around

the vehicle, right? 1 2 Unsafely, yes. Α 3 I didn't ask you about safely or unsafely. I asked you about being able to go around the vehicle. You 4 said yourself that you could go into the lane and go 5 6 around the vehicle, correct? 7 Α Correct. 8 And had you ever made an arrest based off of 9 having to go into another lane of a --10 BY MS. WILLIAMS: Your Honor, I'm going to 11 object to the relevance if he has ever made that 12 arrest before or not. 13 THE COURT: He's asking a question, could 14 he go around the vehicle and has he ever made an 15 arrest because he couldn't go around a vehicle. 16 That's the question I understand. I will allow 17 that. MR. PERRY CONTINUING: 18 I don't recall if I ever have. 19 Α 20 You said that you worked with the City of Hernando for a number of years? 21 22 Yes. 23 I want to show you a serious of photographs, 24 okay. These are from the city of Hernando. I'm just 25 going to ask you if you've seen those -- you're familiar 26 with the streets. 27 You're going to ask me if I'm familiar with the

I'm going to ask you if you're familiar with the

28

29

streets?

Q

```
streets as a law enforcement officer in the City of
 1
 2
     Hernando.
 3
                    BY MR. PERRY: May I approach? I'm sorry.
                    THE COURT: Yes.
 4
 5
          Α
               Yes.
 6
               You recognize that?
          Q
 7
               Yes.
          Α
               Where is that?
 8
          0
 9
               That's in front of the administrative building
          Α
     on the Square.
10
11
               How far are we from that, approximately?
12
              A few hundred feet.
          Α
13
               And you see a vehicle on a lane of traffic on
14
    Caffey Street captured in this vehicle -- in this picture,
15
     I'm sorry?
16
              (Nods head.)
          Α
17
               That's Caffey and Losher. Are you familiar with
18
    that?
19
          Α
               Yes.
20
               And do you see a vehicle captioned in this
    particular photograph?
21
22
               I do.
          Α
2.3
               And does it not appear that this vehicle was on
24
     the right-hand shoulder of this street?
25
          Α
               Yes.
               And if you're trying to go down that street, you
26
    would have go over to the other lane and continue to go,
27
28
     right?
```

29

A Yes.

```
And would you have arrested the gentleman that
 1
          Q
 2
     would own this particular vehicle?
               I can.
 3
          Α
               Without engaging him?
 4
          0
 5
          Α
               Correct.
 6
               But just walking to the scene and seeing it --
 7
     you say it's arrestable -- then you could arrest him
 8
     immediately, though, based off of your testimony
     previously, correct?
 9
10
               Could.
          A
11
              Have you ever made an arrest on somebody who --
12
     when you've addressed them about that.
13
                    BY MS. WILLIAMS: Your Honor, I object.
14
               That's been asked and answered.
15
          A
               I can't recall.
16
                    BY MR. PERRY: I'll move on.
17
                    THE COURT: He said he doesn't know.
                    BY MR. PERRY: Yes, Your Honor.
18
19
                    THE COURT: So that's his answer.
20
    MR. PERRY CONTINUING:
21
               All right. You're familiar with Keenlan Drive?
          0
22
          Α
               Yes.
23
               Where is Keenlan Drive?
24
               It would be in the same neighborhood as where
25
    Carlee Drive is. You've got a glare on the picture, so
26
     I'm trying to see it.
27
              Okay. And that's not too far from where you
    arrested --
28
```

THE COURT: Let him handle that, so he can

29

```
adjust it to the light.
 1
 2
                    BY MR. PERRY: Oh, okay.
 3
                    THE COURT: There is a glare.
 4
                    BY MR. PERRY: Yes, sir.
     MR. PERRY CONTINUING:
 5
 6
               Where is that located?
          0
 7
               It's in the same neighborhood as Carlee.
 8
               Approximately how far from the house that you
          0
     arrested Mr. Welch in?
 9
10
          Α
               Right around the corner.
11
               And would you say less than half a mile?
          Q
12
          Α
               Yes.
13
               About a quarter of a mile at the most, right?
14
          Α
               Yeah.
15
               And based off your testimony and based off the
    parking of that vehicle, you can't go around -- you can't
16
17
     drive directly behind that vehicle without going into the
     other lane to get around it, correct?
18
19
               That's correct.
          Α
20
               And based off your testimony earlier, that's an
     arrestable offense, right?
21
22
               That's correct.
2.3
               But you've never made that arrest that you can
2.4
     remember?
25
                    BY MS. WILLIAMS: Objection, Your Honor,
26
               asked and answered.
2.7
                    THE COURT: Mr. Perry, don't ask that
               question again, okay. You've made your point.
28
29
                    BY MR. PERRY: Yes, sir, I'll move on.
```

```
MR. PERRY CONTINUING:
 1
 2
               Was the car parked on the sidewalk?
 3
          Α
               No.
 4
               Was it parked in front of a public or private
          0
     driveway?
 5
 6
          Α
               No.
 7
               The truck I mean. Now, I'm not -- when I say
          Q
 8
     "car," I apologize, but the vehicle that we're talking
 9
     about.
10
          A
               Correct.
11
               Within an intersection?
          0
12
               It was east of an intersection.
          A
13
               But it wasn't within the intersection, was it?
          0
14
          Α
               No.
15
          Q
               And it wasn't within 10 feet of a fire hydrant?
16
               I don't recall.
          Α
17
               It wasn't on a crosswalk?
          Q
18
          Α
               It wasn't -- was it within feet of a crosswalk
19
20
     at an intersection?
21
               I don't recall how far the intersection was from
22
     where it was parked at.
2.3
               Did you measure how far the right -- or the
     right side tires were in relation to the curb?
24
25
          Α
               No.
26
               You didn't do any kind of measurements at all?
27
          A
               No.
               Between a safety zone or an adjacent curb or
28
```

within 30 feet of points of a curb immediately opposite

29

- 1 the ends of a safety zone? Was it close to a safety zone?
- 2 A No.
- 3 Q Was it within 15 feet of the nearest rail or
- 4 railroad crossing?
- 5 A No.
- 6 Q Was it within 20 feet of a driveway entrance to
- 7 a fire station?
- 8 A No.
- 9 Q Was it alongside or opposite of a street
- 10 excavation or obstruction, such as, stopping, standing,
- 11 and parking would obstruct traffic? In other words, were
- 12 there people out boring the street, like at&t or somebody,
- 13 digging the side of the road next to where that truck was
- 14 parked?
- 15 A You're asking me if there was any construction
- 16 near where the truck was parked?
- 17 Q Right. Was there any kind of construction going
- 18 on where that --
- 19 A I don't believe so.
- 20 Q Was it alongside or opposite any street -- I
- 21 asked you that. I'm sorry.
- Was it on the roadway side of any vehicle stopped or
- 23 parked? In other words, was there a vehicle parked on the
- 24 opposite side of this truck?
- 25 A No.
- Q Was it at any place where official signs were
- 27 prohibiting a person from parking?
- 28 A I don't recall.
- 29 O You don't remember whether or not there was a no

- 1 parking sign out there?
- 2 A I do not.
- 3 Q When you made the -- you said previously that
- 4 you were talking with Mr. Welch, right?
- 5 A Yes.
- 6 Q Mr. Welch was engaging in conversation with you.
- 7 He said some cuss words, right?
- 8 A Yes.
- 9 Q At no point did he ever threaten you, did he?
- 10 A No.
- 11 Q At no point did he ever command you at all, did
- 12 he?
- 13 A No.
- 14 Q He didn't tell you to leave, stay or anything,
- 15 right?
- 16 A No.
- 17 Q Matter of fact, in your testimony previously and
- 18 I think today as well, when you told him he needed to move
- 19 the truck he was starting to move the truck, was he not?
- 20 A He was walking towards the truck, yes.
- 21 Q To move it, right?
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q And at that particular point in time based off
- 24 of what you said to him, he was doing what you asked of
- 25 him, correct?
- 26 A Yes. And I also asked for his ID at the same
- 27 time.
- 28 Q And when you asked him for his ID, he told you
- 29 what?

the officer. So the question is did the officer have grounds to make a lawful arrest, and that means focusing on the charge of obstruction of traffic. And when I look at the definition of "obstruct," Merriam-Webster defines it as, "To block up or close up by an obstacle; to hinder from passage, action, or operation."

Blacks Law dictionary, our bible, defines it as, "To block up, interpose obstacles or to render impassable." And I've look at some of the other surrounding circumstances in -- I guess, in statutes or lack thereof. There has been no testimony that it was illegal to actually park on the street, no testimony that there were no parking signs, or that there is some statute or city ordinance that does not allow parking on the street.

So it all, again, comes down to did this fall under obstruction. Now, this is a two-lane street, and we heard testimony from a resident of the street that there are cars parked on this street all the time. And because it's a two-lane street, any time a car is parked on the street, unless it pulls completely into the yard, some portion of it is going to block the roadway. And the photographs that were entered into evidence in this case show that Mr. Welch's vehicle blocked, you know, probably 80 percent of one lane of traffic but did not go into the

opposing lane of traffic. 1 2 And so, again, I look at what is 3 "obstruct", and I think any definition of "obstruct" means you can't move. Whereas, 4 5 Black's says -- and this, to me, really jumped 6 off the page -- "to render impassable." This 7 was not impassable. The officers that were 8 there, were able to get around. No one was 9 prohibited from getting around this vehicle. 10 Mr. Perry made reference to 63-3-901, which 11 is a list of places where stop and standing and 12 parking a vehicle is prohibited. And, of 13 course, it didn't fall under any of those. But 14 I think our operable statute here refers to 15 actually blocking traffic or obstructing it, and 16 I just don't think that this is -- meets the 17 definition of obstruction by any reasonable reading of the statute or the definition of the 18 19 word "obstruct". Cars were able to pass 20 through. There's no prohibition against --21 legal prohibition against him parking there. 22 Now, there may be homeowners rules or 2.3 restrictive covenants, but that's not a crime. 24 So we turn to the resisting arrest, and 25 it's well-established that an individual has the 26 right to use reasonable force to resist an 2.7 unlawful arrest. The testimony of the defendant 28 was that the defendant refused to comply and put his hands behind his back. He didn't strike the 29

1	officer or take any defensive action. He just
2	didn't let him cuff him. And his level of force
3	did not exceed that of the officers, and I think
4	it would be reasonable under the circumstances.
5	So accordingly, I would find the defendant
6	not guilty on both counts. And, frankly, I'll
7	say this, this is a situation where the
8	homeowner's association is putting the police in
9	a bad situation. There's a if it was a
LO	violation of restrictive covenants, there's
L1	another remedy for this, and it's not by
L2	involving law enforcement.
L3	But that is the order of the Court. If
L 4	there was a bond, it's to be returned. Should
L5	that go directly to Mr. Welch?
16	BY MR. PERRY: Yes, Your Honor.
L7	THE COURT: Make sure the clerk has his
L8	address.
L 9	BY MR. PERRY: Yes, sir.
20	THE COURT: That's the order of the Court.
21	We're adjourned.
22	
23	PROCEEDINGS CONCLUDED
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	

CERTIFICATE 1 2 STATE OF MISSISSIPPI: 3 COUNTY OF TATE: 4 I, MICHELLE A. BROWN, Certified Court Reporter and Notary Public for the State of Mississippi at Large, 5 do hereby certify that I reported in machine shorthand 6 Pages 1-67 of the above-captioned proceedings. I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing pages contain a full, true and correct transcript of my said stenotype notes and digital recording then and there taken. I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am not an attorney or counsel of any of the parties, nor a relative or employee of any of the parties, nor am I a relative or employee of any 10 attorney or counsel connected with the action, nor am I financially interested in the action. 11 I FURTHER CERTIFY that in order for this document to be 12 authentic and genuine, it must bear my original signature and my embossed notarial seal and that any 13 reproduction in whole or in part of this document is not allowed or condoned and that such reproductions should 14 be deemed a forgery. 15 THEREFORE, witness my hand and my official seal in the State of Mississippi on February 8, 2021. 16 17 18 CSR #1395 Notary Public at Large 19 20 My Commission Expires: September 3, 2024 21 MICHELLE A. BROW 22 Commission Expires 23 24 25 26 27 28 29